



## Paper or Plastic - a surprising comparison A study of available technologies for retail flour packaging



VS.



A presentation by Mr. Christian Helwig  
Sales Manager Asia, FAWEMA

## Agenda

- 1. Challenges of Flour Packaging**
- 2. Bag Types - a general comparison**
- 3. Life Cycle Assessment - Ecobalance**
- 4. Cost on Investment and Consumables**
- 5. Result**

## Challenges of Flour Packaging

### Trend:

Selling of foodstuffs in supermarkets instead of village shops.

### Reasons:

- Growing population - urbanisation
- Increased buying power
- Demand on high turnover for packed foodstuff

→ Importance of POS is growing.

### Demands on Flour Packaging for Retail

- easy to handle
- attractive presentation
- protect the product
- compact, tight, properly closed
- correct in weight
- have no leakage
- symmetrical and consistent in shape
- low steam barrier for longer shelf life



## Challenges of Flour Packaging

- “Retail is detail” and to achieve success, your packaged products must present themselves in the right way to the consumer.



## Bag Types - A General Comparison

### Plastic:



- + tear resisting
- + cheap primary packaging.
- + expensive secondary packaging.
- Flexible, fluffy, bad presentation in the supermarket shelf.
- no direct palletising - demand on strong secondary pack

**Bag Types - A General Comparison**

**Paper:**



- Sensitive towards moisture
- Image barrier
- + Self supporting
- + Wide facing for marketing
- + rectangular and consistent shape
- + compact, tight, properly closed
- + Better handling of secondary pack

**Life Cycle Assessment**

**Ecobalance - Expenditure of Energy**

<b>Energy per 1.000kg Packaging</b>	<b>Packaging</b>	<b>Plastic</b>	<b>Paper</b>
<b>Manufacturing</b>		21.630,45 MJ	5224,95 MJ
<b>Transport</b>		900,15 MJ	
<b>Recycling</b>		1290,65 MJ	Integrated in the manufacturing process
<b>Total</b>		<b>23.821.05 MJ</b>	<b>6.125.1 MJ</b>

**Life Cycle Assessment**

**Ecobalance - Carbon Dioxide Emissions**

	Paper (4,5t)	Plastic (1t)
Gas CO <sub>2</sub>	2754000 g	2320000 g
Halon	227,12 g	401,8 g
Methane	74250 g	48400 g
Nitrous Oxid	9336 g	1809 g
Transport	304000 g	67575 g
<b>Total (in CO<sub>2</sub>)</b>	<b>3141813,12g = 3,14t</b>	<b>2438185,8g = 2,44t</b>

**Life Cycle Assessment**

**Ecobalance - Sustainability:**

	Paper	Plastic
<b>Raw Material</b>	99,6 %	0,5%
<b>Energy Expenditure</b> (from renewable energy sources)	11,24% = 3098,74MJ (4,5t)	3,2% = 215,15MJ (1t)
<b>Reusability</b> (within the production cycle)	90%	0%

**Degradability**

Some of the plastic material will be landfilled or burnt instead of recycled. That causes high damage to the environment as only 5% will be degraded after 150 years. Paper, however, will be degraded 100% in short term.

**Potential Risk**

1 Liter oil can contaminate 1.000.000 Liter drinking water.

**Life Cycle Assessment**

**Ecobalance - Conclusion:**

	Paper	Plastic
<b>Expenditure of Energy</b>	+ -	-
<b>Sustainability</b>		
- Raw Material	+	-
- Expenditure of Energy	+	-
- Reusability	+	-
<b>Environmental Pollution</b>		
- Greenhouse Effect	--	++
- Emission Damage	+	-
- Risk Potential	+	-
- Degradability	+	-
<b>Total</b>	+++	----

**Cost****Material Costs:**

- Typical LDPE film, appr. 70  $\mu\text{m}$ , 2 colour printing. Size for 1 kg bag:  
appr. 340 mm web x 220 mm length  
  
→ Approx. USD. 0.59/sqm
- Higher quality film e.g. OPP/PE, same printing, same size  
  
→ Approx. USD. 0.68/sqm
- Paper bag 95 x 65 x 200 mm, 70 g kraft paper, 2 colour printing.  
  
→ Approx. USD. 0.47/sqm

## Cost

Investment for Paper Bag – 220 BPM:

Category	Value
2x Fawema FA 314.3	838,000 €
2x Fawema UP 3	140,000 €
2x Garvens Checkweigher	73,540 €
1x Lorenz Pan Europal 49	109,000 €
1x Liegat stretch wrapper V 300	76,000 €
Transport FCA Northsea port	10,000 €
Installation	70,000 €
<b><u>Total cost</u></b>	<b><u>1,336,540 €</u></b>
<b><u>Total cost per bag:</u></b>	<b><u>6.075 €</u></b>

## Cost

## Material cost – Paper bag( 1 Mio pcs)

Category	Value
Premade Paper bags	30,080 €
<b>Costs (USD 0.47/sqm)</b>	
Hot glue (2x FA 314.3 1g/10bags)	100 Kg
<b>Costs (3.15€/Kg)</b>	<b>315 €</b>
Shrink film (Kg)	3,175 Kg
<b>Costs (1.89€/Kg)</b>	<b>6,000 €</b>
Stretch film (200g/pallet)	8,333 Kg
<b>Costs (3 €/Kg)</b>	<b>25,000 €</b>
<b><u>Total costs</u></b>	<b><u>61,395 €</u></b>

## Cost

## Investment – Plastic – 100 BPM:

Category	Value
2x Fawema VC 250	254,972 €
2x Garvens Checkweigher	73,540 €
1x Case Packer – American Case, with collation	330,000 €
1x Lorenz Pan Europal 49	109,000 €
1x Liegat stretch wrapper V 300	76,000 €
Transport FCA Northsea port	10,000 €
Installation	50,000 €
<b><u>Total cost</u></b>	<b><u>896,742 €</u></b>
<b><u>Total cost per bag</u></b>	<b><u>8.967 €</u></b>

## Cost

## Packaging material plastic ( 1 Mio bags)

Category	Value
LDPE film	44.132 €
<b>Cost (0.59 USD/sqm)</b>	
Box (American Case)	33.333 €
<b>Cost (500 €/1,000 pcs.)</b>	
Stretch film (200g/pallet)	8,333 Kg
<b>Costs (3€/Kg)</b>	<b>25,000 €</b>
<b><u>Total costs</u></b>	<b><u>102,465 €</u></b>

Results

	Plastic	Paper
Appearance	-	+
Ecobalance	-	+
Machine Investment	-	+
Running Cost	-	+
Result	-----	+++++

**Thank you very much for your  
kind attention and consideration!**

**Please find more information at:**

**[www.fawema.com](http://www.fawema.com)**

**Or contact:**

**Mr. Christian Helwig**

**E-Mail: [c.helwig@fawema.com](mailto:c.helwig@fawema.com)**

**Telefon: +49-02263-716-0**

